

# EXHIBIT 16

# EXHIBIT 16

**VAUGHN INDEX II**

U.S. Department of Transportation, Federal Aviation Administration (FAA)

FOIA Request 2015-009570 and FOIA Request 2016-004019

FOIA Request

Documents Withheld and Redacted

Numbers listed in the “code” column correspond with redacted and withheld information in the documents responsive to FOIA Request 2015-009570 and 2016-004019

This includes EX 6 and 7(C) redactions to records produced in:

- the initial production of records responsive to 2015-009570 on March 9, 2018;
- the supplemental production of records responsive to 2015-009570 on March 30, 2018, and
- the supplemental production of responsive records for 2016-004019 on March 30, 2018.

Note that “Vaughn Index I” covers all other redactions, other than EX 6 and 7(C), in response to these same FOIA requests.

## FOIA 2015-009570

Code	Information Redacted	FOIA Exemptions	Rationale
1	Name of Witness, Complainant, or Interviewee	FOIA 6, 7(C)  Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including their names. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
2	Phone number of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA 6, 7(C)  Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their personal information, including their contact information, which would also allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.

3	Email Address of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA 6, 7(C) Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their personal information, including their contact information, which would also allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
4	Position, title, or duty station of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA 6, 7(C) Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
5	Photograph of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA 6, 7(C) Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's

			complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
6	Social media profile of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA 6, 7(C) Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
7	Other information that would allow identification of a witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA 6, 7(C) Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.

8	Financial information of an FAA employee or contractor	FOIA 6, 7(C) Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their personal information, including their financial information. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
9	Subject of Investigation name	FOIA 6, 7(C) Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Subjects in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including their names. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
10	Personal or identifying information of subject to investigation	FOIA 6, 7(C) Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Subjects in misconduct investigations have privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was

			not requesting personally identifiable information.
11	Name of non-witness FAA employee or contractor	FOIA 6, 7(C)  Plaintiff did not request PII	The disclosure of names of co-workers and other personnel mentioned in connection with a law enforcement investigation, who have thus been implicated (directly or indirectly) in the allegations against the subject, would be invasive and is a recognized privacy interest. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. Names of the subject's co-workers and other federal government employees and contractors mentioned in connection to the investigation do not shed light on the activities of the federal government.
12	Personal, identifying, or medical information of non-witness FAA employee or contractor	FOIA 6, 7(C)  Plaintiff did not request PII	The disclosure of names of co-workers and other personnel mentioned in connection with a law enforcement investigation, who have thus been implicated (directly or indirectly) in the allegations against the subject, would be invasive and is a recognized privacy interest. Additionally, disclosure of information that would allow the reader to identify the subject's co-workers and other personnel mentioned in the reports of investigation would be just as invasive to their privacy as disclosure of their names. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. Names of the subject's co-workers and other federal government employees and contractors mentioned in connection to the investigation do not shed light on the activities of the federal government.

13	Personal information for air traffic control applicant in Air Traffic Control application	FOIA 6, 7(C) Plaintiff did not request PII	The disclosure of names and personal information of applicants for federal government employment in connection with law enforcement investigations, who have thus been implicated (directly or indirectly) in the allegations against the subject, would be a violation of these individual's privacy interest. Disclosure of information which may potentially identify these applicants in connection with the investigation would be just as invasive to their privacy as disclosure of their names. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. Names of the applicants federal government employment mentioned in connection to the investigation do not shed light on the activities of the federal government.
----	---	---	--

**FOIA 2016-004019**

<b>Code</b>	<b>Information Redacted</b>	<b>FOIA Exemptions</b>	<b>Rationale</b>
1	Name of Witness, Complainant, or Interviewee	FOIA EX 6  Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including their names. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
2	Phone number of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA EX 6  Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their personal information, including their contact information, which would also allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.

3	Email Address of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA EX 6 Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their personal information, including their contact information, which would also allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
4	Position, title, or duty station of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA EX 6 Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
5	Photograph of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA EX 6 Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's

			complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
6	Social media profile of witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA EX 6 Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
7	Other information that would allow identification of a witness, complainant, or interviewee	FOIA EX 6 Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
8	Financial information of an FAA employee or	FOIA EX 6	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties.

	contractor	Plaintiff did not request PII	Witnesses, complainants, and other individuals interviewed in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their personal information, including their financial information. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
9	Subject of Investigation name	FOIA EX 6 Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Subjects in misconduct investigations have a privacy interest in their identity, including their names. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.
10	Personal or identifying information of subject to investigation	FOIA EX 6 Plaintiff did not request PII	The information in question was compiled as part of a law enforcement investigation into the misconduct of an employee, which could have potentially lead to civil penalties. Subjects in misconduct investigations have privacy interest in their identity, including information which would allow them to be identified. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. The name of the witness in Plaintiff's complaint does not shed light on the activities of the Federal Government. Additionally, Plaintiff specifically stated in his FOIA request that he was not requesting personally identifiable information.

11	Name of non-witness FAA employee or contractor	FOIA EX 6  Plaintiff did not request PII	The disclosure of names of co-workers and other personnel mentioned in connection with a law enforcement investigation, who have thus been implicated (directly or indirectly) in the allegations against the subject, would be invasive and is a recognized privacy interest. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. Names of the subject's co-workers and other federal government employees and contractors mentioned in connection to the investigation do not shed light on the activities of the federal government.
12	Personal, identifying, or medical information of non-witness FAA employee or contractor	FOIA EX 6  Plaintiff did not request PII	The disclosure of names of co-workers and other personnel mentioned in connection with a law enforcement investigation, who have thus been implicated (directly or indirectly) in the allegations against the subject, would be invasive and is a recognized privacy interest. Additionally, disclosure of information that would allow the reader to identify the subject's co-workers and other personnel mentioned in the reports of investigation would be just as invasive to their privacy as disclosure of their names. The plaintiff has not stated a public interest in such information and the agency is not aware of one. Names of the subject's co-workers and other federal government employees and contractors mentioned in connection to the investigation do not shed light on the activities of the federal government.
13	Login Password of FAA employee	FOIA EX 6	Individuals have a privacy interest in their personal information, including information that would provide access to devices where personal information is stored. Moreover, there is no public interest in federal employee network passwords, and this information does not serve to shed light on the activities of the federal government.