

EXHIBIT 15

EXHIBIT 15

VAUGHN INDEX I

Rojas v. FAA, Civ. No. 16-03067

FOIA 2015-009750 and FOIA 2016 4019

This includes EX 2, 5 and 7(E) redactions to records produced in:

- the initial production of records responsive to 2015-009570 on March 9, 2018;
- the supplemental production of records responsive to 2015-009570 on March 30, 2018, and
- the supplemental production of responsive records for 2016-004019 on March 30, 2018.

Note that “Vaughn Index II” covers all redactions made pursuant to EX 6 and 7(C) in response to these same FOIA requests.

Acronyms

Office of the Administrator (AOA)
Office of Safety & Hazardous Materials Investigations (ASH)
Office of Human Resources Management (AHR)
Office of the Chief Counsel (AGC)
Air Traffic Control (ATC)

FOIA 2015-009750

“ASH Documents with bates Redacted”

Bates Number	Record Description	Information redacted	Exemption	Rationale
FAA 9570001404	Record of Interview - Draft document with comments	Comment to draft document providing comment on release of biographical testing information.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001410	Handwritten FAA investigator's notes by Brad Olsen – 2 redactions	Findings of a validation study conducted to predict passing percentages of the FAA's biographical assessment.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001412	Handwritten FAA investigator's notes by Brad Olsen	HR Screening validation testing results of the agency's biographical assessment.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001413	Handwritten FAA's investigator's notes – Brad Olsen	Cut-off percentage for passing the biographical assessment, and the percentage of passing applicants. The biographical assessment is used in agency's ATC hiring process.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001781	Email from AGC attorney Humberto Ruiz to client program office (ASH)	Counsel's advice regarding veterans' preference issues for biographical assessment	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 9570001782	Email from FAA employee Rickie Cannon discussing veterans preference in biographical assessment	Information regarding the biographical assessment related to scoring of minimally qualified applicants in the agency's ATC hiring process.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001783	Email discussing proposed assessment process	Percentages and scoring standards for biographical assessment used in the agency's ATC hiring process.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001786	Email from AGC attorney Yvette (Andrea) Armstead to client program office	Communication from counsel to client regarding allegations against Human Resources	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.

FAA 9570001899; FAA 9570001900	Handwritten investigator notes	Information related to a different investigation – not related to the ROI produced	Non-responsive	The redacted information was previously determined to be non-responsive. However, this information was un-redacted and released to Plaintiff in the March 29, 2018 supplemental release.
FAA 9570001907	Handwritten FAA investigator's notes by Brad Olsen	Percentage pass rate for biographical assessment	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001911	Handwritten FAA investigator's notes by Brad Olsen	Possible percentage pass rate for biographical assessment	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001922	Handwritten FAA investigator's notes by Brad Olsen	Percentage pass rate for biographical assessment	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001943	Email describing integrity and security initiatives for the 2015 ATC entry level job announcement	Information describing integrity and security initiatives for the 2015 ATC entry level job announcement	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570001950 Through FAA 9570001961	Investigation Tracking System – employee security reports	Whole reports withheld, contains extensive PII including name, SSN, employee security risk, assets, family relations, and financial information.	EX 7(C)	Federal employees have a strong privacy interest in the information described in column 3. The employees who are the subjects of these reports were later determined not to be relevant to the investigation, and therefore did not become interviewees or witnesses. Therefore, there is no overriding public interest justifying the release of this information. This personal information of these particular FAA employees does not shed light on agency actions.

“Emails with Bates_Redacted”

Bates Number	Record Description	Information redacted	Exemption	Rationale
FAA 09570 000481	Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorneys Andrea Armstead and Jerry Mellody seeking legal advice	Communication from client related to legal advice from counsel	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 09570 000490; FAA 09570 000862; FAA 09570 000865 Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication	Email from ASH Deputy Assistant Administrator to ASH staff	Portion of email relaying legal advice provided from AGC-100 counsel to FAA employees with need to know the information	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 09570 000515; FAA 09570 000727; FAA 09570 000731; FAA 09570 000736; FAA 09570 000739 Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication	Email from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to client program office (ASH)	Portion of email providing email advice and containing attorney’s thoughts and impressions regarding response to FOIA request asking for documents involved in pending litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA 09570 000518; FAA 09570 000746 (first redaction); Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication	Email between FAA employees	Portion of email relaying advice from AGC-100 counsel to FAA employees with a need to know the information	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 09570 000519 through FAA 09570 000520; FAA 09570 000521 through FAA 09570 000522; FAA 09570 000528 through	Email from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to client program office (ASH)	Portions of email related to communication between counsel and client program office containing legal advice, and portions containing attorney’s thoughts and impressions regarding an investigation which was at the time the subject of pending litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information

<p>FAA 09570 000529</p> <p>FAA 09570 000743 through FAA 09570 000744;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000746 through FAA 09570 000747</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>				<p>prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 000525</p>	<p>Email from AGC attorney Lierre Green to client program office (ASH)</p>	<p>Portion of email where counsel discusses the status of a pending investigation that was at the time the subject of pending litigation, and containing attorney's thoughts and impressions regarding the investigation</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p> <p>Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 000527</p>	<p>Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorney Russel Christensen</p>	<p>Portion of email containing request from client for legal advice from attorney</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 000548</p>	<p>Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorney Russell Christensen</p>	<p>Language from FAA order 1600.20C regarding recording of interviews, which is deemed sensitive unclassified information</p>	<p>7(E)</p>	<p>The information redacted reflects content from an FAA Order that would disclose techniques and procedures of law enforcement investigations, and discloses guidelines for law enforcement investigations. Release of such information would reasonably be expected to risk circumvention of law.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 000551 through FAA 09570 000552; FAA 09570 000558;</p>	<p>Email describing integrity and security initiatives for the 2015 ATC entry level job announcement</p>	<p>Information related to integrity and security initiatives for the 2015 ATC entry level job announcement</p>	<p>EX 2</p>	<p>The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is</p>

<p>FAA 09570 000559 through FAA 09570 000560;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000563;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000564 through FAA 09570 000565;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000568;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000569 through FAA 09570 000570;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000802 through FAA 09570 000803;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000820 through FAA 09570 000821;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000828 through FAA 09570 000829;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000833;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000837;</p> <p>FAA 09570 000845 through FAA 09570 000846</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>				<p>entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 000592</p>	<p>Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)</p>	<p>Advice from counsel regarding declaration to be filed in pending FOIA litigation</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>

FAA 09570 000593;	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)	Advice from counsel regarding declaration to be filed in pending FOIA litigation, and containing thoughts and mental impressions of attorney regarding the litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA 09570 000611	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)	Attorney's description of research she conducted in order to provide legal advice to client	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA 09570 000647; FAA 09570 001083; FAA 09570 001086; FAA 09570 001088; FAA 09570 001090 through FAA 09570 001091; FAA 09570 001155; FAA 09570 001163; FAA 09570 001170; FAA 09570 001281; FAA 09570 001297 Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication	Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorneys Humberto Ruiz and Yvette (Andrea) Armstead	Portion of email regarding client's response to attorney's legal advice, proposing how to implement advice	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 09570 000654; FAA 09570 000656 (redaction 1); FAA 09570 001160; FAA 09570 001165 (1 st redaction); FAA 09570 001171	Email from client Ann Breaux to FAA employees	Portion of email relaying and discussing AGC-100 attorney's advice following a legal review of a report of investigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.

Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication				
<p>FAA 09570 000655; FAA 09570 000656 (redaction 2); FAA 09570 001158; FAA 09570 001161; FAA 09570 001165 (2nd redaction); FAA 09570 001169; FAA 09570 001172</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>	Email from AGC attorney Humberto Ruiz to client program office (ASH)	Portion of email where attorney provides comments pertaining to his legal review of a report of investigation	EX 5	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p> <p>Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 000658; FAA 09570 000664; FAA 09570 001176; FAA 09570 001179; FAA 09570 001183; FAA 09570 001187; FAA 09570 001192; FAA 09570 001197; FAA 09570 001201; FAA 09570 001207; FAA 09570 001212; FAA 09570 001215</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>	Email from AGC attorney Lierre Green to client program office (ASH)	Portion of email setting forth attorney's legal input into a document summarizing the biographical questionnaire	EX 5	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p> <p>Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.</p>
FAA 09570 000662	Email from ASH Deputy Assistant Administrator	Portion of email relaying AGC-100 attorney's advice to FAA employees with a need to know the advice	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 09570 000663	Email from client program office to AGC attorney	Portion of email providing client's response to attorney's questions, for purposes of attorney providing legal advice to client	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.

<p>FAA 09570 000682; FAA 09570 001093; FAA 09570 001095; FAA 09570 001098; FAA 09570 001100; FAA 09570 001102</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>	<p>Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorney Lierre Green</p>	<p>Portion of email re-stating legal advice from AGC-100 attorney on the status of a pending investigation</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 000684; FAA 09570 001109 through FAA 09570 001110; FAA 09570 001112 through FAA 09570 001113; FAA 09570 001116; FAA 09570 001118; FAA 09570 001122;</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>	<p>Email from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to client program office (ASH)</p>	<p>Portion of the email containing advice to client regarding AGC's input into press inquiries about the report of investigation for an investigation that was involved in pending litigation, and portions containing attorney's thoughts and mental impressions regarding next steps to be taken</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p> <p>Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 000867 through FAA 09570 000868; FAA 09570 000870; FAA 09570 000872 through FAA 09570 000873; FAA 09570 000875 through FAA 09570 000876; FAA 09570 000878 through FAA 09570 000879; FAA 09570 000882;</p>	<p>Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)</p>	<p>Portions of email providing advice regarding declaration to be filed in pending FOIA litigation, and containing the attorney's thoughts and mental impressions about the case</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p> <p>Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.</p>

FAA 09570 000884 Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication				
FAA 09570 000869; FAA 09570 000874; FAA 09570 000877; FAA 09570 000880 Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokodom to client program office (ASH)	Attorney's advice to client regarding a declaration, and attorney's thoughts and mental impressions regarding pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA 09570 000941	Email from client program office (AOA) to FAA Chief Counsel Reggie Govan	Program office's response to legal advice from FAA Chief Counsel on legal review of a letter from the program office	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 09570 000942 through FAA 09570 000944	Email from FAA Chief Counsel Reggie Govan to client program offices (ASH and AOA)	FAA chief counsel's advice pertaining to AGC's legal review of a letter drafted by the program office	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 09570 001030; FAA 09570 001033 Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication	Email from ASH Deputy Assistant Administrator to FAA employees, including FAA Chief Counsel Reggie Govan	Portion of email relaying preliminary advice from AGC-100 regarding the agency's authority to provide complainants' names to member of Congress	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 09570 001104; FAA 09570 001105 through FAA 09570 001106; FAA 09570 001107; FAA 09570 001283 Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication	Email from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to client program office (ASH)	Portion of email containing advice from attorney regarding search and release for records responsive to Plaintiff's FOIA requests, which are the subject of pending litigation, and containing attorney's thoughts and mental impressions regarding the status of the search and release	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.

<p>FAA 09570 001143; FAA 09570 001145</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>	<p>Email communication between FAA ASH employees</p>	<p>Portion of email discussing advice from AGC-100 attorneys pertaining to AGC's legal review of report of investigation</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 001186; FAA 09570 001190 through FAA 09570 001191; FAA 09570 001195; FAA 09570 001205 through FAA 09570 001206; FAA 09570 001211</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>	<p>Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorney Lierre Green</p>	<p>Portion of email responding to attorney's questions and discussing the legal advice provided by the attorney</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 001190 (1st redaction); FAA 09570 001205 (1st redaction); FAA 09570 001210 (2nd redaction)</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>	<p>Email from AGC attorney Lierre Green to client program office</p>	<p>Portion of email following up on advice previously provided to the program office regarding legal review of a summary of the biographical questionnaire</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 001182; FAA 09570 001199 through FAA 09570 001200</p>	<p>Email between FAA employees</p>	<p>Portion of email where client program office is formulating their response to AGC attorney's legal advice regarding attorney's legal review of a summary of the biographical questionnaire</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>
<p>FAA 09570 001204; FAA 09570 001210 (1st redaction)</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>	<p>Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorney Lierre Green</p>	<p>Response from program office to AGC-100's legal advice pertaining to a legal review of a summary of the biographical questionnaire</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>

FAA 09570 001302	Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorney Lierre Green	Portion of email regarding confidentiality of a document provided to AGC-100 for legal review	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
------------------	---	---	------	---

“ROI Bates 216-374”

Bates Number	Record Description	Information redacted	Exemption	Rationale
FAA-9570 000279	Aviation Careers Status Report	Report redacted – contains information and analysis on number of ATC applicants in response to job announcements.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA-9570 000280	Email between AHR personnel	Number of ATC applicants, number of ATC students, number of ATC students expected to remain in the program, number of ATC applicants in the inventory	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA-9570 000281	End of Email between AHR personnel	Information regarding which candidates in the inventory should be used.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.

“Bates 001-215”

Bates Number	Record Description	Information redacted	Exemption	Rationale
FAA-9570-000131 through FAA-9570-000146	Full data analysis of the barrier analysis for the ATC centralized hiring process	Overall statistical information that would provide information related to barriers for ATC applicants during the biographical assessment	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.

“HR Documents”

Bates Number	Record Description	Information redacted	Exemption	Rationale
FAA 9570 002009; FAA 9570 002013; FAA 9570 002046	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA’s human resources applicant tracking system	Description of what will make an ATC applicant ineligible, and information related to applicant scoring.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002011; FAA 9570 002015; FAA 9570 002048; FAA 9570 002162	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA’s human resources applicant tracking system	Information regarding scoring of the biographical assessment for the ATC hiring program, including an example of a passing score.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002018	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA’s human resources applicant tracking system	Information providing programming routes related to branching of responses to questions in the biographical questionnaire.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002020	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA’s human	Information related scoring, basic qualifications, and weighting of answers to the biographical	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is

	resources applicant tracking system	assessment used in FAA's ATC hiring process.		entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002021 (first redaction)	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA's human resources applicant tracking system	Information providing programming instructions related to branching and scoring in the biographical assessment questionnaire used in the FAA's ATC hiring process.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002021 through FAA 9570 002038	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA's human resources applicant tracking system	Questions and scoring information for FAA's biographical questionnaire used in the ATC hiring process.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002039 through FAA 9570 002040	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA's human resources applicant tracking system	Scoring and weighting information for biographical questionnaire used in the ATC hiring process.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002047	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA's human resources applicant tracking system	Instructions for programming USAJobs information from applicants into HR's application tracking system	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002049 through FAA 9570 002050	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA's human resources applicant tracking system	Information regarding basic qualifications for ATC applicants pertaining to the biographical assessment.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002050 through FAA 9570 002068	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA's human resources applicant tracking system	Full biographic assessment questions and answers, and scoring, weighting, and grading information	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002068 through FAA 9570 002093	Instructions for programming ATC applicant information into AVIATOR, FAA's human	Information regarding answers to each individual questions that are part of the biographical	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is

	resources applicant tracking system	questionnaire questions, as well as scoring and weighting of the answers.		entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002119	Email between FAA AHR employees	Questions in the biographical questionnaire; information regarding scoring and changes to scoring	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002163	Email	Information regarding applications for a particular testing cycle of the biographical assessment	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002164 Redaction 1	Email	“we are fine with this language”	EX 5	This information was withheld in the initial March 9, 2018 release, but has now been un-redacted and released.
FAA 9570 002164 through FAA 9570 002165; FAA 9570 002166 through FAA 9570 002167	Email	Information regarding qualification screening, barrier analysis, cut-off scores, and proposed changes during the development of the biographical assessment	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002173	Email	Information regarding the ability of ATC applicants to perform certain functions on the biographical assessment	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.

FAA 9570 002174 Redaction 1	Email	Information regarding the scoring and weighting of biographical assessment questions.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002174 Redaction 2	Email	Information regarding the scoring and weighting of biographical assessment questions.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002175 Redaction 1	Email	Information describing the development of the biographical assessment for use in ATC hiring.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002175 Redaction 2	Email	Information describing the development of the biographical assessment for use in ATC hiring.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002178	Email from AGC attorney Humberto Ruiz to client program office (ASH)	Advice to program office from attorney pursuant to a legal review of draft language	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 9570 002182	Email between FAA employees	Portion of email relaying advice of AGC attorneys to FAA employees with a need to know the information	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 9570 002184 through FAA 9570 002185	Email	Draft message to ATC applicants who are filling out applications.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.

FAA 9570 002186 (redactions 1 and 2); FAA 9570 002193 (redactions 1 and 2)	Email	Feedback from quality assurance test takers regarding the biographical questionnaire.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002189	Email	Information describing the development of the biographical assessment for use in ATC hiring. Describes the process of validating biodata.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002190	Email	Biographical questionnaire question and sample answers	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002191 (redactions 1 and 2)	Email	Information describing the development of the biographical assessment for use in ATC hiring.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002191 (redaction 3)	Email	Information describing the development of the biographical assessment for use in ATC hiring.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002204	Powerpoint/Guidance/Training	Information describing the hiring process for ATC applicants, as well as barriers and selection criteria	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002205	Powerpoint/Guidance/Training	Information describing the hiring process for ATC applicants.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is

				entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002206	Powerpoint/Guidance/Training	Information describing the hiring process for ATC applicants.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002207	Powerpoint/Guidance/Training	Information describing the hiring process for ATC applicants.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002208	Powerpoint/Guidance/Training	Information describing the hiring process for ATC applicants.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.
FAA 9570 002208	Powerpoint/Guidance/Training	Information describing the hiring process for ATC applicants.	EX 2	The redacted information meets the requirements of the exemption as it is entirely internal and related solely to agency personnel rules and practices.

“Attachments to Emails”

FAA 9570 002242	Draft of ASH Report of Investigation	Comments and edits to the draft report of investigation provided by AGC attorneys	EX 5	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p> <p>Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.</p>
-----------------	--------------------------------------	---	------	---

FOIA 2016-004019

FAA 4019000173 (3 redactions); FAA 4019000187 (3 redactions);	Weekly Status Report for eDiscovery, June 6-10, 2016	Information related to litigation holds issued by FAA attorneys in a class action lawsuit against the FAA, and action taken by the IT professionals in response for this issuance of legal hold.	EX 5	Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA4019000204	Weekly Status Report for eDiscovery, June 13-17, 2016	Information related to litigation holds issued by FAA attorneys in a class action lawsuit against the FAA, and action taken by the IT professionals in response for this issuance of legal hold.	EX 5	Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA4019000212	E-Discovery Status report, June 20-24, 2016	Information related to litigation holds issued by FAA attorneys in a class action lawsuit against the FAA, and action taken by the IT professionals in response for this issuance of legal hold.	EX 5	Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA4019000201	Weekly Status report for ediscovery requests, April 11-15, 2016	Information related to litigation holds issued by FAA attorneys in a class action lawsuit against the FAA, and action taken by the IT professionals in response for this issuance of legal hold.	EX 5	Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA 4019000343	Email sent from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to AGC attorney Russell Christensen	Draft of message to FAA Chief Counsel Reggie Govan providing a full update of a pending litigation	EX 5	Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.

FAA 4019000344	Email sent from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom	Email content discussing next steps related to FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA 4019000345	Email sent from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)	Contents of email discussing next steps and proposed contents of declaration for FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA 4019000358	Email sent from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to client program office (ASH)	Contents of email describing next steps related to FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA 4019000370 (redaction 1)	Email between employees of client program office (ASH)	Portion of email relaying AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom's legal advice regarding pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications

				between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 4019000370	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)	Portion of email providing instructions for next steps related to FOIA litigation, and an explanation of the status of the pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA 4019000371 (redaction 1)	Email from client program office to AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom	Communication between client and program office concerning pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 4019000371 (redaction 2)	Email sent from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)	Email describing instructions for program office to take and information needed for pending litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 4019000372 (redaction 1)	Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorneys Linda Ubokudom and Russell Christensen	Communication between client program office and AGC attorney regarding pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 4019000372	Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC	Communication between client program office and AGC	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects

(redaction 2) through FAA 4019000373	attorneys Linda Ubokudom and Russell Christensen	attorney regarding pending FOIA litigation		confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 4019000373	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)	Communication between client program office and AGC attorney regarding pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 4019000374	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)	Communication between client program office and AGC attorney regarding pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 4019000378	Email sent from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorney Russell Christensen	Email responding to questions from AGC attorney regarding issues in pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 4019000379	Email sent from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to client program office (ASH)	Email discussing issues in a pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA 4019000476; FAA 4019000479 Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication	Email from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to AGC attorneys Linda Ubokudom and Humberto Ruiz	Content of email reflecting attorney's thought process for revisions of a declaration in pending litigation	EX 5	Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.

<p>FAA 4019000476- FAA 4019000477; FAA 4019000480</p> <p>Note that these are duplicate emails containing the same communication</p>	<p>Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom</p>	<p>Discussion of client program office with attorney regarding the status of pending FOIA litigation</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>
<p>FAA 40190009477(second redaction) through FAA 4019000478</p> <p>FAA 4019000480 through FAA 4019000481</p>	<p>Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)</p>	<p>Content of email containing legal advice from AGC attorney regarding declarations to be used in pending FOIA litigation, and discussing litigation strategy</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p> <p>Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.</p>
<p>FAA4019000500 (redaction 1)</p>	<p>Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)</p>	<p>Email where AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom discusses pending FOIA litigation with client program office</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>
<p>FAA4019000500 (redaction 2) through FAA 4019000501</p>	<p>Email from client program office to AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom</p>	<p>Email where AGC attorney discusses pending FOIA litigation with client program office</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.</p>
<p>FAA4019000501 (second redaction)</p>	<p>Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)</p>	<p>Email from AGC attorney discussing next steps in pending FOIA litigation with client</p>	<p>EX 5</p>	<p>Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications</p>

				between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA4019000502	Email from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to client program office ASH	Email from AGC attorney discussing next steps in pending FOIA litigation with client, and describing the status of the litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA4019000509 (redaction 1)	Email from client program office (ASH) to AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom	Email from AGC attorney discussing next steps in a pending FOIA litigation with client	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA4019000509 (redaction 2)	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office ASH	Email from AGC attorney to client discussing pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA4019000510 (redaction 1)	Email from client program office to AGC attorney Russell Christensen	Email to AGC attorney describing next steps to take in FOIA litigation in response to advice from attorney	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.

FAA4019000510 (redaction 2); FAA4019000364; FAA4019000490 FAA4019000495	Email from AGC attorney Russell Christensen to client program office ASH	Email from AGC attorney to client program office discussing next steps in pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office. Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA4019000364	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office (ASH)	Email from AGC attorney discussing next steps in pending FOIA litigation	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA4019000488	Email from client program office ASH to AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom	Email discussing next steps in pending FOIA litigation with client	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA401900489	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office ASH	Email discussing next steps in pending FOIA litigation with client	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA401900490 through FAA401900491; FAA4019000496;	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to AGC attorney Russell Christensen	Email discussing issues with pending FOIA litigation and the status of the case	EX 5	Attorney work-product privilege. The redacted portions of the record consist of confidential work product information prepared by FAA

FAA4019000504; FAA4019000360; FAA4019000367 through FAA4019000368; FAA4019000486 through FAA4019000390; FAA4019000496 through FAA40190003497				attorneys in contemplation of litigation.
FAA4019000503 (redaction 1)	Email from client program office AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom	Email discussing issues with pending FOIA litigation and the status of the case with client	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.
FAA4019000503 (redaction 2)	Email from AGC attorney Linda Ubokudom to client program office	Email discussing issues with pending FOIA litigation and the status of the case with client	EX 5	Attorney-client privilege. The information redacted reflects confidential communications between an FAA attorney and the client program office.